From: Ehud Barak <ehbarak1@gmail.com>
To: Justin Mondshine <Justin@pointstate.com>
CC:
Date: Fri, 11/7/2014 1:59:57 AM
Subject: Re: The Scowcroft Group -- Ukraine: Mariupol Attack Would Signal Complete Breakdown of Ceasefire, with New Sanctions Likely

---

Justin
It won't happen tonight. A sensitive situation is developing.
Brinkmanship on both sides. VP would prefer not to do it. But cannot afford appearing as as swaying under pressure. Gloves are off but both sides still trying to avoid actual clash. Zacharchenko probably tries to drag VP into action.
I'm going on 15hrs flightx2 from Buenos Aires to San Francisco. We can discuss it when I land together with Iran vs P5+1 post midterm elections.
Best
EB

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 6, 2014, at 19:01, Justin Mondshine <Justin@pointstate.com> wrote:

Ehud,

Curious for your take on the piece below piece which speculates that Putin might make a run for Mariupol after all. The author reasons he might do so because a) Zakharchencko – the self-proclaimed PM of Donetsk has announced that he would take the city one way or another, b) Russian troops are re-massing along the border which apparently has been confirmed by NATO, c) Porochenko has reinforced the city so clearly shows concern for the possibility, d) Minsk accord is effectively broken at this point so gloves are off, and e) Putin kills two birds with one stone by taking the city – he gets his Crimea land bridge and deals another blow to Ukraine – who humiliated him with overwhelming pro-European turnout in the latest elections.

Do you think Putin would be so economically reckless to make a move at this point? No doubt it would engender additional sanctions at a time when the ruble is already under collapse.

Best,

Justin

From: Scowcroft Analysis [mailto:analysis@scowcroft.com]
Sent: Thursday, November 06, 2014 11:24 AM
To: Anna Lund
Subject: The Scowcroft Group -- Ukraine: Mariupol Attack Would Signal Complete Breakdown of Ceasefire, with New Sanctions Likely

Attached please find our report on:

Ukraine: Mariupol Attack Would Signal Complete Breakdown of Ceasefire, with New Sanctions Likely

Please do not hesitate to contact us should you have any questions.

Kevin Nealer
The Scowcroft Group
900 Seventeenth St., N.W.
Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20006
(202) 296-9312

From: **Frank Miller**
Date: **November 6, 2014**

Ukraine: Mariupol Attack Would Signal Complete Breakdown of Ceasefire, with New Sanctions Likely

On November 2 the breakaway Lughansk and Donetsk regions of eastern Ukraine held elections in defiance of the September 5 Minsk peace agreement. The resulting tensions may well lead to a resumption of larger-scale combat in the region.

The Kremlin was clearly stung by the late-October elections in the parts of Ukraine controlled by Kiev: the results strongly indicated the pro-European orientation of most Ukrainians. As a result, Russia did nothing to stop the "counter-elections" in Lughansk and Donetsk that installed pseudo-independent regimes in those two areas. Kiev has since cut off payments to the two regions, claiming that they have repudiated ties to the legitimate Ukrainian government and therefore do not merit financial support. This, in turn, prompted fiery rhetoric from the new heads of the breakaway regions.

According to the Russian press, on October 30 Alexander Zakharchenko—newly elected "Prime Minister" of the self-proclaimed Donetsk People's Republic—stated that the region's militia plans to take control of the city of Mariupol on the Sea of Azov if negotiations with Kiev fail: "We are holding talks on Mariupol, they don't want [this] peacefully. If it doesn't work peacefully, then we'll use force." This was accompanied by reports of Russian troop and materiel movements into Donetsk. In response, President Poroshenko announced that he is sending reinforcements to Mariupol and three other cities. There are reports today that shelling of Mariupol resumed over the past weekend.

We believe there is a significant likelihood that Ukrainian separatists, backed by Russian forces, will attack and capture Mariupol. If they do so, it is then likely that they will drive all the way to the Crimean peninsula, thereby taking territory that holds the power generation and water supplies on which Crimea depends (and freeing Crimea from any possible Ukrainian pressure). **This result would lead to further US and EU sanctions on Moscow.**

<TSG 2014-11-06 Ukraine.pdf>